

THE COUNTY COUNCIL OF THE CITY & COUNTY OF CARDIFF

The County Council of the City & County of Cardiff met at City Hall, Cardiff on Thursday 19 December 2013 to transact the business set out in the Council Summons dated 13 December 2013.

Present: County Councillor Derek Morgan (Lord Mayor in the Chair);

County Councillors Ali Ahmed, Manzoor Ahmed, Dilwar Ali, Aubrey, Bale, Bowden, Boyle, Bradbury, Bridges, Burfoot, Carter, Chaundy, Clark, Richard Cook, Corria, Cowan, Davis, De'Ath, Derbyshire, Evans, Ford, Furlong, Goodway, Gordon, Govier, Graham, Groves, Hinchey, Howells, Hudson, Hunt, Hyde, Javed, Keith Jones, Margaret Jones, Joyce, Kelloway, Knight, Lent, Lomax, Love, Magill, Marshall, McEvoy, McGarry, McKerlich, Merry, Michael, Mitchell, Murphy, Parry, Patel, Phillips, David Rees, Dianne Rees, Robson, Sanders, Simmons, Stubbs, Benjamin Thomas, Graham Thomas, Huw Thomas, Thorne, Walker, Walsh, Weaver, Craig Williams, Darren Williams and Woodman.

118 : APOLOGIES

County Councillors Ralph Cook, Goddard, Holden and Lloyd.

The Lord Mayor wished Councillor Ralph Cook a speedy recovery.

119 : WEBCASTING AND RECORDING OF PROCEEDINGS

Members were reminded of a decision of the Constitution Committee on 10 July, 2008 to webcast the Council meeting. Members were also reminded that the Constitution Committee had previously agreed that Council proceedings be recorded for administrative purposes.

Formal approval to record the proceedings was agreed.

120 : MINUTES

The minutes of the meeting of the County Council meetings held on 21 November 2013 were approved as a correct record and signed by the Chairperson subject the following corrections: -

Page 266 – Min No 97: delete County Councillor McEvoy as an apology and include as those present.

Page 267 – Min No 100 – Councillor Mitchell correction from ‘pecuniary’ to ‘*non-pecuniary*’ interest.

Page 268 - Min No 101: Para (ii): correction the deletion of the word ‘father’ replace with ‘*mother*’.

Page 293 – Min No 109 : Supplementary Question – *County Councillor Bale*: correction – the deletion of the word ‘Walsall’ replace with ‘*Warsaw*’.

Page 304 – Min No 109 – Supplementary Question – *County Councillor Woodman*: Correction – the deletion of the word ‘spitting’ replace with ‘*spilling*’

121 : DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

The Chairman reminded Members of their responsibility under Article 16 of the Members’ Code of Conduct to declare any interest, and to complete Personal Interest forms, at the commencement of the item of business.

The following declaration was made:

<u>Councillor</u>	<u>Item</u>	<u>Interest</u>
Councillor Derbyshire	Item 12: Appointment of Local Authority School Governors	Personal interest – related to one of the nominees

122 : ANNOUNCEMENTS

(i) Nelson Mandela

The Lord Mayor expressed sadness at the recent passing of Nelson Mandela, and acknowledged all the tributes that had been made to him through the Book of Condolence. He was truly inspirational and a symbol of light and hope in the world.

Nelson Mandela's first and only visit to Wales was on 16 June 1998, when the City of Cardiff was proud to honour him with the Freedom of the City of Cardiff. It was a remarkable day and will

be remembered by all who took part and witnessed the celebrations.

[As a mark of respect for Nelson Mandela Members observed a minute silence].

(ii) Riverside and Splott By-Election

The Lord Mayor welcomed Councillor Ed Stubbs elected to represent the Splott Ward and Councillor Darren Williams elected to represent the Riverside Ward at the By-Election on 5 December, 2013 to their first meeting of the County Council and invited each of the newly elected Councillors to say a few words.

(iii) Condolences

Former Lord Mayor and Councillor Jeff Sainsbury

Sadly former Lord Mayor and Councillor for Rhiwbina Jeff Sainsbury passed away on 2 December 2013. First elected for the City Council Rhiwbina Ward in May 1969 he served until May 1979; was re-elected in May 1983 and became Lord Mayor of Cardiff in 1991; he stood down as a Councillor in 1996. He was also on the Board of Directors for the Cardiff Bay Development Corporation and was committed to his charitable work in particular for Tenovus Cancer Care, Prostrate Cancer and Red Sock Information Group.

The Lord Mayor on behalf of the Council had sent a letter of condolences to his widow Jan, son Mark and daughter Emma and all the family for their sad loss.

Former Deputy Lord Mayor and Councillor Winston Griffiths

It was with sadness also that the Lord Mayor was advised that former Deputy Lord Mayor and Councillor Winston Griffiths had passed away at the age of 88. He represented the ward of Whitchurch and Tongwynlais from May 1979 until 1996 and again from May 1999 to 2004. He was Deputy Lord Mayor in 1993.

The Lord Mayor on behalf of Council had passed Members sincere sympathy to his widow Iris, and our former colleagues Brian and Linda; and grandson Jonathan at this sad time.

(iv) Lord Mayor's Charity – Foodbank Collection

The Lord Mayor thanked Members for their generous contributions to the Foodbank Collection. The donations would be gratefully received and be distributed to those most in need in our city over the coming weeks.

(v) Congratulations

Congratulations to Councillor Gareth Holden and his wife Sophie on the birth of their baby daughter, Isabel on 8 December, 2013.

(vi) Welcome

The Lord Mayor welcomed Paul Orders, the Chief Executive to his first meeting of Council and looked forward to working with him. In addition the Lord Mayor thanked Christine Salter for undertaking the Interim role during a period of change for the Council, and Members showed their appreciation.

(vii) Christmas Greetings

The Lord Mayor wished Members and Officers Nadolig Llawen – Merry Christmas and a Happy New Year – Blwyddyn Newydd Dda

123 : PUBLIC QUESTIONS

EDUCATION AND LIFELONG LEARNING QUESTION

Public Question: *Essex Havard*

As music tutors rarely enter their profession in order to be experts at fundraising, could you please outline what support Cardiff Council fundraising officers have given their counterparts in Cardiff and Vale of Glamorgan Music Service in order to identify, and secure, new funding

streams to ensure the Service's continued success in engaging and inspiring the children and young people of the City.

Reply: *County Councillor Magill*

I share your aim to ensure that we have a vibrant and inspiring music service for young people in Cardiff. I am pleased to say that since the last budget the music service has already successfully attracted new funding, and I can confirm that senior managers in the education and finance teams are providing advice to the music service about securing even more new funding streams; and of course the music service has its own management team as well.

The Music Development Fund was devolved to schools in April 2013 and all of this is now under the control of schools. This work has been focussing on whole class engagement.

Contracts with schools for the 2012/2013 financial year, prior to delegation, totalled £72,392. From April 2013 to date, contracts with schools for the Summer Term amounted to £30,683; for the Autumn Term, this increased to £34,760. This amounts to an increase of 35%. The projected estimate for the Spring Term 2014 is £35,000; and the total contract spend for the year is projected to be £100,443 - which represents an increase of £28,051 or approximately 38%. So that is really good news in the development of that resource.

The service has also attracted some sponsorship for example, the Christmas Showcase Concert.

The Finance team is also providing advice to the Music Service on the tracking of contracts and the linkage between demand and the number of music tutors employed in order to ensure a balanced budget in relation to the peripatetic service and ensembles.

Supplementary Question: *Essex Havard*

Seemingly quite a rosy picture in terms of finances.

Thank you for letting us know about the help that senior officers are giving the service in order to identify and secure alternate sources of

funding. I do hope that this help is frequent and sustained in order to meet the challenges face by the service as a result of the budget changes.

I wonder if Councillor Magill is aware of, and perhaps would like to comment upon, the fact that since the budget changes in February there are now 800 fewer children receiving peripatetic music lessons in Cardiff schools; and 100 fewer children in the 24 music ensembles run by the service. I also understand that there are almost 200 fewer children in the Vale of Glamorgan receiving peripatetic music lessons - I know that this is not for this debating chamber - but that makes for the service a total of almost 1000 fewer children in the 10 months since fees increased by 11%; and these are the music service's own figures.

Reply: *County Councillor Magill*

I was aware of those figures. In fact the total number of children accessing the service is around 8,000 so the reduction of 800 relates to round about 10%. There was a dip in take up in 2009 when there was an increase of fees at that stage and a poor financial picture, a recession at the time as well. What happened was that gradually, as the economic situation improved, the numbers picked up again and we hope that that will happen over time.

I think an interesting dynamic though - and I know it is something that you and I discussed last year - was trying to minimise the impact on children who are from more disadvantaged backgrounds; and I think the increase of 38% of the resources available to the Music Development Fund is really positive in that respect. But it is also interesting, and it may not be disconnected from the publicity around the budget last year that there has also been an increase in uptake of children who take free school meals.

There has been increase in the number of those children accessing the service and I think that that is positive and something we can build on.

You asked me about the support we were giving to build further funding streams and that was how I responded. I don't mask that it is obviously to be regretted that the numbers have dropped in this initial phase. But I do hope that they will pick up again we will provide whatever support we can to ensure that that happens.

We are working very closely with the music service and looking at a number of quite innovative ways that might work in the future and I certainly intend to maintain that support.

SPORT, LEISURE AND CULTURE QUESTION

Public Question: *Peter Castree*

At St Joseph's Catholic Sports and Social Club we have been working with the Council, trying to keep open Maindy Bowling green at Crown Way. To this end, we have submitted petitions, letters of support, a Community Asset Transfer (CAT) business plan and been working with Councillors to gain support and with Officers to move this forward. We are trying to prepare for next seasons fixtures, with a first team, second team, mid-week teams, league matches, cup competitions and friendly fixtures for over 50 bowls members. We are receiving mixed messages from Council Officers. Is this because Officers themselves are unsure of our future?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

The Council is currently reviewing its Community Asset Transfer Strategy and a report on the issue is due to be considered by the Cabinet in January. This will assist in determining the approach that the Council adopts generally in the future towards the initiatives. The Council and its officers have been quite clear about the need to progress the Community Asset Transfer with St Joseph's Bowls Club at the Maindy site. Indeed, you will probably know that I wrote recently to the club emphasising this commitment.

In addition, the Council has undertaken a comprehensive programme of winter maintenance of the bowling green which will enable the club to fulfil its 2014 fixture programme. The commitment to carry out this programme was given earlier in the year and, indeed, the efforts made by the Council in terms of green maintenance were recognised by the club representatives who have been in contact with us recently.

Council officers will continue to support and work with club representatives in order to help achieve its aims, and I understand that the next meeting with the club representatives is due to take place in January 2014.

Supplementary Question: *Peter Castree*

I would like to acknowledge what the Councillor has said and thank him for the work that has been done.

I must say that although there has been work done on the green and although there is a Community Asset Transfer involved, the main thing from today is the fact that this Council and its officers are completely behind our request judging by the reply the Councillor has given to us - which is very good as far as we are concerned.

Although some good work has been done on the green I have to state that in its present state the pavilion is unsuitable for use. We have a ladies team joining us next season but in Cardiff's year as European Capital for Sport will we have suitable changing facilities - I have to ask yes or no?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

With regard to the repairs to the pavilion roof, this has also been identified by the Council officers and will be undertaken in closed season, together with the installation of new ceiling plasterboards as well - so there is some work being carried out on those parts.

But also you have got a meeting with our officers on the 7 January, I would welcome any of those concerns you have to be brought to that meeting and I will be requesting from the officers a feedback on the concerns you have got and I will see what actions we can carry out on those things.

125 : PETITIONS

The following petitions were submitted:

Councillor McEvoy - 170 signatures opposing the proposed funding cut to the 'Wyndam Street Day Centre/Diner'.

Councillor Clark - 600+ signatures from residents of various wards across Cardiff opposing plans to collect blackbags and wheelie bins once a month.

Councillor Gordon - 60 senior citizens of Pontcanna drawing attention to the danger and fear of falling when walking near local shops in cathedral Road and Pontcanna Street; and a request to seek improvements to road safety on the junction of Severn Grove and Mortimer Road and Conway Road and on the pavements of Mortimer Road and William Street which is the link with the main road and bus stops.

126 : COMMUNITIES, HOUSING & NEIGHBOURHOOD RENEWAL STATEMENT

Building Communities White Paper

The process of implementing the recommendations of the “Building Communities” White Paper which was agreed by the Cabinet in October were in progress. The White Paper made a series of proposals to improve locality working and make our six Neighbourhood Partnerships more effective and one of the most important recommendations was that local members must have a clear role in shaping local priorities.

Each Neighbourhood Partnership will also have a lead Elected Member and one of their responsibilities will be to Chair the local Strategic Group. The role of the Lead Elected Member is not in any way a replacement for the crucial role of the Ward Councillor in promoting local democracy. Neither is it intended to be a political role. This role will be key to working across all political groups to facilitate County Councillor and Community Councillor involvement, where applicable, in the delivery of each Partnership’s Neighbourhood Action Plan. Following Council the role profile and expectations for the role of Lead Member will be circulated.

These are hugely challenging times facing public services and it is now more important than ever to work with partners to solve problems and address the needs of communities. The Council has a huge part to play in bringing people together to improve service delivery and these roles are an exciting opportunity to use the enthusiasm and knowledge which exists in the Council to shape how we respond to local need.

For those expressing an interest in becoming a Lead Member, all submissions will be considered by the Cabinet Member with lead responsibility for neighbourhood partnerships who will make a recommendation for Cabinet approval.

This is an important opportunity which recognises the role of Elected Members as local champions and community leaders and the Cabinet Member looked forward to Members active involvement in taking forward the new partnerships.

In response to comments made about the neighbourhood areas, the Cabinet Member indicated that the neighbourhood partnerships would be reviewed in 18 months.

127 : ENVIRONMENT STATEMENT

The Cabinet Member provided a summary of ongoing.

Waste Strategy

One of the very early decisions made by the current administration was the need to develop a new waste strategy that complied with the EU Directive and delivered value for money. Results from the waste consultation which attracted 1887 responses are currently being analysed. Alongside this - the service, with assistance from Welsh Government, has modelled all waste collection options for the city - early results show that the best option in terms of value for money is a smaller black bin and kerbside sort.

Fly Tipping

Recent fly tipping data has been encouraging. Comparator data for this year compared to last has shown a decrease in fly tipping incidents of 35%. The Council is working with BBC Watchdog to name and shame a company that is responsible for multiple cases of fly-tipping across the city. The increased emphasis on enforcement has also seen 52 individuals formally interviewed for incidents relating to large scale fly-tipping and 10 offenders have been prosecuted. Further improvements have been brought in to increase the amount recycled from fly-tipped waste while retaining all possible evidence available to prosecute the offenders. Natural Resource Wales are loaning Cardiff two additional fly tipping cameras for the City.

Household Waste Recycling Centre Sites

In January 2014, as part of the development of a new Waste Strategy and as a result of a root and branch review analysing productivity, a full consultation will take place on the Household Waste Recycling Centres (HWRC) in the city. The recycling rate from our HWRC's is well below the industry average and more emphasis needs to be placed on pre sort as opposed to the more expensive post sort. Site times also need to adjust to better meet resident demand in order to help us meet our statutory targets in the most challenging financial settlement for Cardiff.

The context to the need for this review is shown through the audited figures for 2011/12 which shows Cardiff came 20th out of the 22 Local Authorities with a recycling diversion rate of 58% from our sites - the average in Wales was 66% with the best performing authority achieving 93%.

Regulatory Collaboration

A draft business plan has now been developed for a regional regulatory service with Bridgend and the Vale of Glamorgan Councils. This project was highlighted in the recent Peer Review as a proactive step to deliver change. This proposed alternative plan for service delivery has to be right for Cardiff. The financial, legal and HR implications for Cardiff Council and its staff have to be fully understood and scrutinised in great detail to ensure that the project provides value for money for Cardiff, and delivers a more resilient customer centric service, and The Cabinet Member indicated that once this is established he will discuss the progress with fellow Councillors in the other local authorities in the New Year.

Cyd Cymru

The Cyd Cymru collective energy switching scheme has extended the deadline for registration until 12 January 2014 due to increasing demand. Nearly 5000 registrations have signed up to the scheme so far and a further targeted advertising and marketing campaign aims to increase this figure further to support vulnerable communities in the city. Consideration was also being given to rolling out a bulk buying initiative further into areas such as insurances, broadband etc. Fellow Councillors had been asked to inform their residents about the scheme through ward surgeries. The Cabinet Member believed that there was a shared view of

the need to provide value for money to residents and this scheme is an excellent example on how to do this in partnership with the Vale of Glamorgan, but supporting other Local Authorities and housing associations across Wales. There is no obligation, it's free to register and residents can phone for free on Tel No: 0800 093 5902.

Finally, Councillors were reminded about the revised waste collections during the Christmas season, these were advertised on the front page of the current Capital Times, press releases have been issued to the South Wales Echo and all information is available through Connect 2 Cardiff.

The Cabinet Member emphasised the need for value for money and to ensure the best model and service to taxpayers, and that all consultation was open to Members to respond.

128 : CHILDREN'S SERVICES STATEMENT

The Cabinet Member advised that earlier she had hosted an event to celebrate Cardiff Council signing the Children are Unbeatable Pledge. Council passed a motion in April to sign up to the campaign which calls for the equal protection for children with respect to physical chastisement. The campaign is asking Welsh Government to legislate now to remove the 'reasonable chastisement' defence (section 58 of the Children Act 2004) and to join the countries across Europe which have changed attitudes towards the chastisement of Children, seemingly without controversy.

Speakers at the event included Children's Commissioner, Keith Towler; Chair of the Corporate Parenting Panel - Councillor Jonathan Evans; Councillor Richard Cook; Andy James Chair of the Children are Unbeatable Alliance; Vivienne Laing NSPCC; and Dayle Luce, Cardiff Youth Council. Pupils from Ninian Park School also performed at the event and talked about the importance of children's rights with the support of their Head Teacher, Mrs Davies. The Cabinet Member thanked everyone who participated in the event, particularly the Communications team who organised the event and materials.

In order to ensure that Cardiff Council fully addresses its duty to implement the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child, The Cabinet Member indicated that she would be bringing a Cabinet report in the new year that seeks agreement for Cardiff Council to acknowledge its

obligations under the Children Act 2004 and the UNCRC and to fully embed these obligations into the decision making and operational practices of the Council. This will demonstrate that Cardiff will embed the UNCRC in everything it stands for and enshrine rights in the core of the policy framework. This will ensure that Cardiff Council shows due regard to Children's rights when passing policies, ratifying policies and in operational decisions.

129 : CALCULATION OF COUNCIL TAX BASE 2014/15

Under its powers in Section 68 of the Local Government (Finance) Act 1992, as amended, the Council was required by the Welsh Government to approve the calculation of the Council Tax base. The Council Tax base calculation is a complex annual exercise that is used by the Welsh Government for the distribution of Revenue Support Grant. It is also used by the Council for calculating the Council Tax charges for each year.

The Cabinet Member for Finance and Economic Development, Councillor Goodway commended the Cabinet Proposals for the calculation of Council Tax base for 2014/15 to approve the proposal for Council to delegate this power to Cabinet with effect from 2014/15. The proposal was seconded by Councillor Weaver.

RESOLVED – That

- (1) the calculation of the Council's tax base for the year 2014/2015 be approved;
- (2) pursuant to this report and in accordance with the Local Authorities (Calculation of Tax Base) (Wales) Regulations 1995, as amended, the amount calculated by Cardiff Council as its council tax base for the year 2014/2015 shall be 138,759;
- (3) pursuant to this report and in accordance with the Local Authorities (Calculation of Tax Base) (Wales) Regulations 1995, as amended, the amounts calculated by the Council as the council tax base for the year 2014/2015 in the community areas subject to a precept shall be as follows: -

Lisvane	2260
Pentyrch	3131

Radyr	3588
St. Fagans	1183
Old St. Mellons	1256
Tongwynlais	804

- (4) the arrangements for the payment of precepts in 2014/2015 to the South Wales Police Authority be by equal instalments on the last working day of each month from April 2014 to March 2015 and the Community Councils be by one payment on 1 April 2014, be on the same basis as that used in 2013/2014 and the precepting authorities be advised accordingly.
- (5) the following Local Choice function be designated as an Executive (Cabinet) function:
- Functions in respect of the calculation of council tax base in accordance with any of the following—*
- (a) *the determination of an item for T in section 33(1) and 44(1) of the Local Government Finance Act 1992;*
- (b) *the determination of an amount for item TP in sections 34(3), 45(3) 48(3) and 48(4) of the Local Government Finance Act 1992;*
- (c) *the determination of an amount required for determining an amount for the item mentioned in paragraph (a) or (b) above.*
- (6) the Monitoring Officer be instructed to amend the Constitution in relation to (5) above accordingly.

130 : TREASURY MANAGEMENT MID-YEAR REPORT 2013/14

The Council's Treasury Management activities are governed by legislation and the revised Code of Practice 2009 developed by Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy (CIPFA). Council requires its Audit Panel to scrutinize its Treasury Management Strategy and Practice.

The Cabinet Member for Finance and Economic Development, Councillor Goodway drew Members attention to the mid year monitoring

report of Treasury Management activities between 1 April and 31 October 2013. Councillor Weaver seconded the report.

RESOLVED - That the Treasury Management Mid Year Report 2013-14 be noted.

131 : ORAL QUESTIONS

ENVIROMENT QUESTION

Question : *County Councillor Aubrey*

Are you confident that the streets of Cardiff are cleaner following the recent changes in street cleaning arrangements?

Reply: *County Councillor Govier*

For the last 6 years street cleansing has been a top priority for the Cardiff residents and I am absolutely confident that a change had to happen because for 6 years they have been asking for improvements and have not really been seeing them.

The changes that we have implemented take place on the 14th January is when we will really start to see some of the impacts of those and we will be monitoring them throughout the quarters in terms of means testing; public feedback; also Councillor feedback; and we are prepared still to make further changes. I have mentioned before about Cardiff Outdoors approach and we want to make sure that our street cleansing teams do start crossing over to parks and housing lands. So this is Phase 1 of a 3 years programme that we are looking to address what residents have been asking for 6 years.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Aubrey*

Obviously we have had a certain amount of change already in terms of the Community Sweepers, and you won't be surprised that my experience certainly has been that I have seen increased requests for extra cleansing support as a result of that. I am not going to ask about that, what I want to ask about is my observation has been that not just in the areas where Community Sweepers have been withdrawn but in the areas where this policy is talking about increasing the level of support, my experience and

the experience of colleagues, particularly those colleagues who have much greater experience of where the problems are in the city, I think our collective experience is that, in the instant, things are actually getting worse and I am wondering are you personally monitoring that situation both in this interim period up to 14th January and then beyond?

Reply: *County Councillor Govier*

Observations are a bit of a soft judgement, I think, to make those determinations on. If I was on your side of the bench and you were here I would probably have the same observations. There was a recent by-election in Riverside and I think it was on every single leaflet that went around to every single house and we increased our majority there.

What can see and what we are experiencing in terms of our trial wards, we are seeing improvements fly tipping is down, year-end results looking better, and we are seeing less complaints coming in for street cleansing on our trial wards. What we have to do now is roll this out wider across the city.

There are different causes to litter in different areas really and what we are trying to do is establish what they are and address them. I think every ward needs to be treated slightly differently if you look at the Zone 2 areas Keep Wales Tidy are very descriptive what we need to do there to improve those areas; so I think it is very early to say how this new regime is doing. I think what we need to do is let it bed in a little bit and I will report back in a few months.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Walker*

I can tell the Councillor how the regime is doing - very very poorly indeed. I had a telephone call this morning from Heol Cefn Onn where the same property had its garage flooded for the second time in a month literally since you started a new regime of not cleaning the roads in Lisvane. So will you contact Mr Baker of Heol Cefn Onn, I will give you his details, in fact go along and see him and have a chat with him because I think you will learn a number of interesting things?

Reply: *County Councillor Govier*

I have looked at all 10 complaints that have come in from Lisvane over the last 2 years to street cleansing, and I will absolutely if you pass me his

details contact him, but again I am not sure you can relate that to any changes we have recently made. We are monitoring the complaints and the issues that are arising through the city, we will probably get some issues when we start to put this change in and bed it in. But look it could not have stayed the same for 6 years people have been asking for it, for three years the top three priority has been street cleansing. How could we stay the same, how can we justify that to the Cardiff people? We have got to make improvements to our street cleansing arrangements and that is what we are doing.

EDUCATION AND LIFELONG LEARNING QUESTION

Question : *County Councillor Dianne Rees*

18 months into your administration and Cardiff does not have a single grade one banded school in the authority and some of the poorest PISA results in the world. Do you believe that the Banding and PISA testing systems as applied to secondary schools are an accurate reflection of the educational standards of our schools and when can we realistically expect significant improvements in the education of our children and young people?

Reply: *County Councillor Magill*

Education is of course one of this administration's overriding priorities. I should clarify that the 2012 PISA results relate to Wales as a whole rather than to Cardiff, however, St Teilo's Church in Wales High School, which is a high performing Band 2 school that is one of the City's best secondary schools, performed well in the PISA tests and will certainly have contributed positively to Wales' results despite the disappointing national figures overall.

Banding provides a context which allows schools to compare themselves with other schools in similar circumstances, but it doesn't account for differences in standards of attainment. Despite methodological issues leading to volatility in banding results, I have always been clear that education attainment in Cardiff was well behind where it should be and to that extent the banding results give an indication that further progress is clearly needed.

This administration has put in place practical steps to improve performance in Key Stage 4 including a number of projects and strength and leadership in the consortium.

To answer your question directly I would expect to achieve 65% achievement on average at level 2 plus by 2016.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Dianne Rees*

What therefore is your explanation then for the overall worsening performance of Cardiff schools dropping in their banding position- sometimes by two points - and the stubborn bottom banding position of a number of Cardiff schools; and are you having any discussions with the Minister in the Assembly about Cardiff's performance; and what in particular are the nature of your discussions?

Reply: *County Councillor Magill*

The issue with banding is that it is a measure of relative performance. So in fact Cardiff schools performance at Key Stage 4 on the key measures did actually go up last summer and in fact on Level 2 it went up by 5%.

There is clearly an issue, and something we need to do, that I am doing, taking urgent steps to put support in over, there is clearly an issue with mathematics and that is across the city. I have been working with the Central South Consortium to make sure that mathematics support is keyed into all of our Secondary schools this year to try to make sure that we get an increased performance in mathematics by next summer; and certainly over the next couple of years we need to be making step increases in performance so that we are operating at the sort of level of the top performing PISA schools which is the aim.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Bowden*

Councillor Magill you and I have been in communication this week because I did draw attention to the fact that there was an absence of briefing for Councillors and Chairs of Governors before these bandings were released to the press, and clearly they were very disappointing. They were disappointing results- and we, as Councillors, will be having questions from our residents about them - clearly parents are going to be very disappointed, and Governors will need to know, particularly in

Primary schools, how they can help to assist with the bandings higher up. Could you ensure that all the Councillors now get that briefing note that you sent to me that enables them to understand the background as to how those bandings were arrived at?

Reply: *County Councillor Magill*

Just to confirm we do not get much notice of it going into the press. It is a very quick process.

I am very happy to circulate the briefing. As I said we are already planning to send it to Governors as part of a Newsletter to Governors so that is in hand.

In terms of the overall position in relation to Cardiff schools we do have a particular problem with Key Stage 4, and as I have said that relates an awful lot to performance in mathematics and we are seeing a huge differential between performance so that on Level 2 we are 73 – 74% but only 50% on Level 2 inclusive – that is one of the areas that has to be bridged.

In terms of primary schools they are actually performing rather better and we are starting to see the comparability with that performance with comparable English Cities as well improving, so we do have a particular problem with Key Stage 4, but the rest of the picture is starting to move forward.

FINANCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor Robson*

What checks are carried out to ensure that supplies and contracts arranged via the procurement department represent best value for money?

Reply: *County Councillor Goodway*

The Council's constitution includes the Contract Standing Orders and Procurement Rules which provide the framework for ensuring that public money is spent with demonstrable probity and in accordance with the Council's policies. Dependent on value, these rules ensure there is a proportionate level of competition and where necessary contracts are

advertised and tendered in accordance with the European public procedure legislation.

Where there is a recurring need for the same goods, services and works the Council has a number of framework arrangements in place. These will have been tendered in competition either by the Council or, in the case of collaborative arrangements, by a public sector body. As well as complying with European legislation, frameworks also deliver competitive pricing through economies of scale and enable Directorates to minimise their costs of sourcing, ordering and payment particular where ordering online through catalogues.

However, as budgets tighten we need to ensure that the framework arrangements used by the Council offer best value for money. Therefore, the Commissioning and Procurement Service has this week issued a survey to provide Council staff with an opportunity to feedback their views on the price, quality and performance of our framework arrangements.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Robson*

I do not know if you are hearing this, but I am hearing from various departments examples of where our procurement procedures are not quite as tight as they should be in terms of best value for money or times scales for repairs. I can think of examples of where departments previously made their own arrangements for example a repair to a particular item, go through the tendering and procurement process and the new company that deals with it still sub-contracts to the original company but charges more for that, there being an example of that.

Is there a way that you can institute so that members of staff of the Council could bring this to attention directly of the senior management team or Cabinet without fear of retribution of any sort, so almost like anonymous feedback type form, so that they can raise these issues where council tax payers money is not being spent as well as it could be.

Reply: *County Councillor Goodway*

You are asking me if I am aware of these ad hoc conversations that go on between Elected Members and members of staff and we don't even know who those members of staff are. I can tell that they have been going on

for 27 years at least where you get back room talk and nobody is prepared to stand up and demonstrate that the facts are correct. In each case I have to say that I have ever taken up some of these issue it has always been demonstrated to me that there is little or no substance in the claim that is being made.

What I can say is that there should be no question of fear of retribution, because somebody picks up the phone and says to the Procurement Team do you realise that you are charging me 'x' pounds for that and I could buy it down the road for 'y' for less. I just do not accept that that culture exists in this council that people can't just question that they could get a better price somewhere else.

If you have got concrete examples then let me have them tell me who they are and I will investigate them without any fear of retribution on the individuals concerned. But you have got to be prepared to name names

COMMUNITIES, HOUSING AND NEIGHBOURHOOD RENEWAL QUESTION

Question 4: *County Councillor Chris Davis*

The Joseph Rowntree Foundation on Saturday had found that homelessness had increased in England by 34% in three years after a trend that saw homelessness fall prior to 2010. It is claimed that has happened as a result of the coalition benefit caps and their Bedroom Tax. They also blame the lack of affordable housing in the Country also. Has the city of Cardiff seen a similar trend within the last three years?

Reply: *County Councillor Thorne*

Cardiff has also experienced a 34% increase in homelessness in the past three years, coupled with a reduction in the development of affordable housing being built due to reductions in funding.

In terms of homelessness, there is no direct correlation between increased presentations to the Housing Benefit Size Criteria changes – Cardiff Council and its social landlord partners are proactively supporting those who are being affected.

In general, the economic downturn and wider Welfare Reform changes are the underlying reasons for increased homelessness experienced in Cardiff.

To boost the development of new affordable homes, Cardiff is planning to deliver approximately 1600 new homes over the next 10 years, as I have said before at least 40% will be affordable but that is an increase of at least 600 on my previous statements.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Chris Davis*

As well as the recent report I do not know if you are aware but last night a labour motion asking the UK Government to seriously look at the increase in Foodbanks was defeated by a combination of Conservatives and Liberal Democrats. The scenes at the Commons were described as some of the worse witnessed in Parliament as Tory MP's jeered stories of hardship from the Labour benches.

Can you clarify what we, as a Labour administration, are doing in an attempt to mitigate these horrendous policies before a future Labour Government will come in and abolish the Bedroom Tax?

Reply: *County Councillor Thorne*

I have made it clear previously that we are supporting as many people as possible, the Lord Mayor is supporting the Foodbank, and I think all of us as Councillors also support the Foodbank but I agree with you that the behaviour of Members of Parliament was appalling.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Carter*

Those are quite scary figures you have presented there Councillor Thorne and I would challenge them in some ways, I would be curious if you could share with members where that large figure came from. My question Im is that in the first year of the last Lib Dem minority administration we passed a motion meaning that we would no longer use bed and breakfast accommodation, can you give an assurance that with these figures if they are as awful as you put them out to be that this council will continue in that spirit and not use bed and breakfast accommodation?

Reply: County Councillor Thorne

It goes without saying that that is what we would attempt to avoid at every circumstance but there may be an odd occasion, and it has not happened yet, if all the temporary accommodation, if all the hostel accommodation is full and somebody presents as homeless then we have to address it but at this moment at time that is not the case and we are looking to make sure that we have sufficient temporary accommodation available.

SPORT, LEISURE AND CULTURE QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor Woodman*

In the budget an amount of money was set aside to market/promote council owned venues e.g. Cardiff Castle, Mansion House etc. Could you please let me have a breakdown as to how much of this money has actually been spent, and what it has been spent on/how it has been spent?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

A budget of £82,270 was allocated in 2013/2014 to market Cardiff Castle, City Hall and the Mansion House and to ensure the maximum return on investment of these venues.

Of this budget, £63,088 has been spent to date on a range of marketing initiatives. For examples include:

- Printing and distribution of promotional information;
- Targeted advertising to promote the use of our venues for conferences, business meetings, weddings and civil partnership ceremonies;
- Events, trade and education marketing, including providing support for the attendance of the Cardiff Conference Bureau at 'The Meetings Show UK' in July this year;
- Advertising a hospitality package at City Hall for the Wales –v– Italy Six Nations match on 1 February through e-marketing and social media.

The remainder of the budget is due to be spent in the first quarter of 2014 on marketing initiatives such as:

- a Cardiff Castle Visitors' Guide;
- an Events Guide;
- a Wedding Brochure for Cardiff Castle; and
- activity to promote afternoon teas, wedding packages; and
- a Wedding Showcase event at the Mansion House.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Woodman*

Could you provide me please, I appreciate you cannot do it tonight, could I please be sent a breakdown individually for City Hall, Cardiff Castle, and Mansion House please, the amount that has been spent on those three separately so that I can see if it has been quite fair across the board.

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

Yes I will.

QUESTION TO THE CHAIR OF PLANNING COMMITTEE

Question: *County Councillor Dianne Rees*

At last month's Council meeting, I was pleased to hear that Cardiff has been successful in being selected as one of six cities in the UK working towards becoming a sustainable Food City with an appointed sustainable Food coordinator working with partners to transform access to local, affordable and sustainable food for people across the city. Cardiff Food council states that the best way to slow down the growth of Cardiff's food footprint (by far the largest component of Cardiff's ecological footprint), create local jobs and improve our health, is to increase our consumption of fresh local, seasonal and organic foods.

Reply: *County Councillor Michael*

In order to meet the evidenced and urgent need to provide new homes within the city, it is inevitable that some high quality agricultural land will be lost, but taking all relevant factors into consideration, this loss was considered to be justified by the Planning Committee following lengthy consideration of this particular application.

As you will be aware, the Committee resolved to grant outline planning permission on 11 December, subject to it not being called-in by the Welsh Government Minister and the successful completion of a Section 106 Agreement.

You will be aware that the application also included proposals for a community orchard and allotments as part of the development. Moreover, the release of this specific site for housing will contribute to the Council being able to demonstrate a five year supply of land for housing, which will add strength to the protection of a good quality land elsewhere in the city.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Dianne Rees*

This application for 1020 houses on green fields on Bridge Road was not only a departure from the plan it contravened national policy to protect good quality agricultural land for future generations, and moreover it had major consequences far beyond the local area; so why therefore was it not referred to the Assembly Minister to determine it before it was granted by the Council?

As you know it has now gone to the Assembly.

Reply: *County Councillor Michael*

As I understand the Assembly Minister can call this in if they want to. Every application is assessed through proper law, through proper planning guidance, whether large or small, this is exactly what happened in this case.

Cardiff is vulnerable at present because we don't have a 5 year supply of housing land, mainly because of the incompetence of the last administration. This will go part way to helping us become masters of our own destiny quite frankly.

What puzzles me is that you have not quite grasped the problem. Your Government in Westminster, especially the Planning Minister, keeps telling us, recognises that there is a housing shortage. It is recognised in Wales, it is recognised in this Council. This application was properly assessed, went to committee, committee voted to pass it.

You are welcome to your views.

CHILDREN'S SOCIAL SERVICES QUESTION

Question *County Councillor Sanders*

The key findings in the Children's Health and Disability service report taken to cabinet recently makes for shocking reading, but should not be of any surprise as that is what parents have been reporting for some time. Not only is there evidence of poor communication between partners, organisations and even parents but Key Finding 2 demonstrates a contravention of the 1989 Children's Act that the Council does not have a register of Children with a Disability. Recommendation 18 in the report requires an action plan be developed though no timescale is given.

What are your key improvement priorities to ensure the service becomes fit for purpose and what timescale have you set for the delivery of the necessary actions?

Reply: *County Councillor Corria*

I welcome the Scrutiny Report, and I absolutely have to ensure that the recommendations are implemented. I am pleased to provide an update today.

- A new lead manager has been appointed from within the service to develop and take forward a coherent action plan to respond to the scrutiny report and enable implementation of an effective multi-agency strategy.
- The action plan is at second draft stage, and I anticipate that it will be available for scrutiny early in the New Year.
- There is a plan in place to stabilise staff teams across children's services by ensuring early recruitment to permanent posts. Stability of the CHAD service is key to addressing the findings of the report.
- The newly appointed lead manager has been actively discussing how engagement with parents can be best achieved so that engagement in planning becomes an integral part of the way we develop services over the long term.
- Early progress has already been achieved in introducing more effective system to manage operational and financial pressures

within the service and this is already having an impact favourably on morale.

- The Director of Children's Services has also secured the agreement of health and other partners to use Welsh Government regional collaboration funding to commission an options appraisal for remodelling and modernising services for children and young people aged 0-25 based on national best practice. The appraisal will consider the feasibility of an integrated service model with health partners and the Vale of Glamorgan Council.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Sanders*

In recommendation 2, you say that you will be establishing the register for disabled children. Will you agree with me that not having such a register as required under the Act, I am not sure if I remember, but I thought we had assurances in the Chamber that there was actually a register, but maybe that is for another date, but as you know there is a register that needs to be in the Act - and that this not having one is complete unacceptable leaving the potential for these children to fall through the gap for any service provision.

Could you give me a reassurance of the timescale as to when this register will be completely robust and will have every disabled child as a requirement within in it, to ensure that those children who need it receive the services that they should have?

Reply: *County Councillor Corria*

There currently is not a register of disabled children in Cardiff and I know that because I was the person that asked the question earlier on in the year. The action plan, I can't tell you an exact time scale now, but the action plan will specify exactly when that register will be available and I share your concerns and I am committed to making sure that that does happen.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Walker*

Don't you agree that this sort of nitty gritty stuff that you have reported back as an answer to that question is the sort of thing that should have been in your statement to Council, instead of that we have signing children's pledges with commissioners which is all very nice, and may be

important in its own right, but the sort of stuff you have just been talking about now is more the sort of stuff we need to hear about because there are major long standing problems in Children's Services. You need to be advising us in your statements about what you are doing about them.

Reply: *County Councillor Corria*

The statement that I have provided to Council today is actually quite important because it is something that the Council committed to together so an update is absolutely relevant. At Scrutiny in January we will be bringing forward an improvement plan for Children's Services, and I am absolutely well aware of the challenges within Children's Services portfolio and actually have shared that with the new Chief Executive, because if we don't actually provide safe services for children in Cardiff then we are all in trouble aren't we. I am actually taking that responsibility extremely seriously.

ENVIRONMENT QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor Gordon*

We are very fortunate in Riverside and Pontcanna to have so many tree lined streets. However, the leaf fall on the pavements is hazardous, especially now we have had some rain and the pavements have become slippery. What is the Council doing this winter to ensure our streets remain safe from wet leaves?

Reply: *County Councillor Govier*

You may be surprised to know this but when I put forward an invest to save option to uproot all the trees in the city and replace them with fake ones – unsuccessful – there is over a million trees in the city at the moment and I think there is never going to be a time when we can clear every leaf in the city but we have changed the focus of the street cleansing teams onto leaf fall. In terms of Riverside you had a tidal parking clearance on the 3 December, on the 11 December as well, they were in Riverside again, addressing the leaf issues but it is huge problem and I am looking at next year what we can do in the period of the leaf fall season where we do change the focus of the street cleansing teams to focus first on the leafs and second on the litter.

We can, I hope, stop people dropping litter but we cannot stop the trees shedding their leaves.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Gordon*

I will admit that the street cleansing has greatly improved in Riverside, but the leaves I am afraid have not, and in some streets they are still not cleared. The leaves are a risk and they block the drains so with the rain coming that we have had this week the pavements are beginning to flood. I just wondered if you could be a bit a little bit more specific. The litter teams move around the ward on foot with clear bags and litter pickers, but the best way to clear leaves is clearly with brushes and wheel barrows and mechanical sweepers. Where is this equipment, how many mechanical sweepers are there deployed across the city, and please can we see some proper sweeping of the leaves.

Reply: *County Councillor Govier*

Thank you for your observation on the cleanliness of the streets. The mechanical sweepers, the large and small mechanical sweepers are the best way to address the leaf issue. I cannot remember what is in Riverside off the top of my head, but on the Cabinet Report and the information I sent to all Councillors you will see what you have in Riverside that comes into play on January 14th. But, like I said, the focus of all street cleansers across the city at this moment in time is being put on to leaf fall as opposed to litter to address the issues that you have raised.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Craig Williams*

Bearing the question in mind and your answer and that some residents of the city would actually like to help you in terms of cleaning up leaves. Will you accept that you pulled the green bins far too early considering the amount of leaves that were falling down, and residents of this city helping you clearly them up in a true community spirited gesture.

Will you reflect on that and next year and move it?

Residents accept that you don't need green bins collections quite as frequently – January/February, perhaps later on, but this year you pulled it far too early and also the communications actually completely failed.

Reply: *County Councillor Govier*

I don't think that I need to go over the green issue again, but where we picked the dates we did actually pick it from the Waste Strategy that was approved by this Council before my time, but I do recognise that we need to look at those dates next year.

In terms of residents doing a fantastic job in the city, we have just launched, because I know you all like consultations, the Community Litter Plan Consultation and we are getting good engagement with that from residents about what they can do to help and I think that it is fantastic when they do. It takes us back to many years ago when more people did that kind of thing, and I think we are going to need that going forward to help us address the problems in the city.

In terms of the resource issue, as we have now changed the cleanliness programmes of the city even wards like Lisvane are getting more now than they did before.

ENVIROMENT QUESTION

Question : *County Councillor Chaundy*

Will there be any change of policy on leaf fall clearance next year?

Reply: *County Councillor Govier*

What we have done this year actually is change the focus of the cleansing team to be on leaf fall as opposed to litter at the moment. I think that next year we are probably going to have to do that during a certain period but I have got to be mindful that we may see a litter increase in that street so they can only focus on one or the other as their primary job.

I think what also we are going to look to do is to try the Cardiff Outdoors approach, try to look at some of the Cleansing Teams that work outside of the Environment Department to work out how we can bring in that resource to help us address the issue next year.

I think what I am going to do next year is to bring forward a bit of a policy or a plan and share that with Councillors well in advance so you can see what we plan to do and that will include a tidal – where we move

the cars, put up signs and clean the streets - that will include those programmes and we will look to bring that forward at the beginning of the year so you can see what we are going to do during the leaf fall period.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Chaundy*

The lack of leaf clearance this year has likely added increased problems to people slipping, falling and consequent serious injuries, in addition to increased risks of flooding to properties due to blocked drains and all manner of other costs.

Do you now believe that you were wrong to ignore the problem this year?

Reply: *County Councillor Ashley Govier*

I don't think we have ignored it; we have not changed anything with the programme. If you look at the last 3 years, even on the average complaints that have come in to the Council on leaf fall issues, there have been about 200, the same this year.

We have not ignored the problem we just have not done anything with it. I think what I need to do something is to do something with it. I said before in my scrutiny 2 years ago I was putting the leaf fall on my leaflets so we do need to do something better to address leaf fall but I would not say that it is something we have done, we haven't changed anything but I do think we need to change something.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Hudson*

I will be interested in working with you for a programme for next year, but we have a particular problem in certain streets where it's flooding and where the leaf fall is particularly high. The one thing that I want to note though was that some of the machines that are collecting the leaves are not big enough in certain streets. I will look forward to working with you.

Reply: *County Councillor Ashley Govier*

I will look forward to looking with you as well.

FINANCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor De'Ath*

Do you think Cardiff would benefit from the Council adopting a model of Zero Based Budgeting?

Reply: *County Councillor Goodway*

Zero based budgeting was the vogue in the mid-1980s, particularly in private sector organisations and, believe it or not, I did try, when I was the Chair of Finance in the former South Glamorgan County Council before 1992, I did try to prepare a County Council budget one year on a zero based basis, and it was not entirely successful.

When undertaken organisation-wide, zero based-budgeting is recognised as being very time consuming, and it certainly was, and resource hungry. Cost issues aside, in large organisations such as the Council, splitting a multi-million pound budget down into decision packages results in a too overwhelming level of information. For these reasons, these days wholesale zero based-budgeting is now commonly regarded by industry specialists as being unworkable.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor De'Ath*

Do you feel Cardiff might benefit from the Council adopting a model of priority based budgeting, such as the well-respected methodology developed by Aberdeen City Council.

Reply: *County Councillor Goodway*

I would assert that we do adopt a priority based budget setting process, and those priorities, of course, are the ones that the Council establishes in its Corporate Plan.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor McKerlich*

Though you Councillor Goodway may I congratulate Councillor De'Ath on his welcome transition towards capitalism and I would like to say to Councillor Goodway that in fact you were in the right of it 8 years ago, because if you do a combination of priority based budgeting to work out

exactly what the council should be doing and combine that with bench marking so that you know which of your activities you are doing well, you are in a position to cut costs using a scalpel – targeted cutting - instead of swinging an axe mindlessly and brainlessly which you are in danger of doing.

Reply: *Councillor Goodway*

Aneurin Bevan taught us that socialism is the language of priorities and what I have learned since I have been sitting in this Chamber, sitting opposite you Councillor McKerlich is that your priorities don't reflect mine.

EDUCATION AND LIFELONG LEARNING QUESTION

Question : *County Councillor Boyle*

Could you provide us with a list of all Neighbourhood Learning classes (together with venues) that have been cancelled or will not be running as originally scheduled and advertised?

Reply: *County Councillor Magill*

There have been 45 courses that were advertised in the neighbourhood learning brochure, but which had to be cancelled. I will provide you with a list of the specific courses and venues following this meeting if that would be helpful.

The reasons for cancellation were either due to the resignation of a tutor before a course commenced, or due to the lack of numbers enrolling on a course which are required to cover the costs of running the course. In such circumstances, where possible, learners were transferred to another class if one was running, which would help to make up the numbers to make it financially viable to run.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Boyle*

It would be useful to have that written breakdown. I must admit 45 is rather more than I had thought but it's obviously going to be particularly disappointing for those affected, people who had booked and hoping for a course to run its entire length. Though I do of course I accept the

agreement that courses must pay their way. I suppose it strikes me then that this is a problem of both planning and marketing. One, to ensure that we put on courses that people want to attend in the first place and two that people know about those courses.

Do you have any plans to ensure that neighbourhood learning does thrive in the future?

Reply: *County Councillor Magill*

Neighbourhood learning is in the process of undergoing some significant change not least because the Welsh Government has reprioritised the way that it allows grants to be used in terms of neighbourhood so we have to spend 80% of the money that is available on courses that are about reskilling people and getting people ready for the work place and so on. That does have an impact on the more recreational courses which now have to be self-financing.

It is something we are working on and there are arrangements whereby the overall responsibility is going to the WEA to run this across Wales.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Marshall*

Neighbourhood learning is obviously closely allied to community learning and we have some fantastic Communities First learning going on in Willows High School. I wonder whether the Cabinet Member would join with me in congratulating Joy Ballard, the Headteacher at Willows High School, the Governing Body, the staff and all the children for the school continuing to move up the bands and it's now gone up a further band, that has just been announced.

Reply: *County Councillor Magill*

It is certainly the case that if you are looking at very high performing school systems then the support that a child has outside of school is very, very important, and community learning has a real role to play in engaging adults in learning that can then better support their children, so that is an important link.

In terms of looking at the banding and performance of schools across Cardiff generally, the performance at Willows High School has,

admittedly from a very low base, been spectacular. It has gone up 20% in 2 years. If we could replicate that across the whole of the city we would be in a much better position. So I am very happy to congratulate Joy, the Governors, the staff because the children, everyone involved because they have made great strides forward in a very short space of time.

FINANCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor Cowan*

How many people are currently employed as external interims and consultants?

Can you advise of the numbers and the associated costs during 2011/2012 and 2012/2013.

Reply: *County Councillor Goodway*

The Council currently has 32 consultant organisations working with the Council compared to 53 last year and 79 in 2011/12. The Council currently has 24 individuals employed as interims, but unfortunately, I am not able to provide you with the number for previous years as the individuals concerned were employed by companies and no records of the number of individuals involved were kept.

The comparative spend is, in 2012/13 - that's the first year of the Labour Administration we spent £5m, around about £5m on consultants and interims compared to some £6.7 million by the Liberal Democrat / Plaid Cymru Administration in 2011/12 and I anticipate a further significant reduction when the 2013/14 figures are published.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Cowan*

If you remember last year Councillor Goodway, I put you on notice that I was going to ask you in relation to the spend on consultants because previously it has been extraordinarily high and I am pleased to see that we do have a reduction. I was even more concerned to hear you mention about no record of numbers from the previous administration, perhaps you could enlighten me as to why this information isn't available, and can you just make sure that in future years this information is available and

we can just see how this spend is being processed on behalf of the tax payers.

Reply: *County Councillor Goodway*

Well you would have gathered from my response that the Council is now keeping records of the numbers of individuals who are employed as interims; and I guess it was it is just a systems issue that we were paying companies who were employing a large number of people who were working as interims in the organisation.

In terms of how we have managed to reduce the quantum of spending on consultants and interims, it is a no brainer isn't it, as we said at the time, if you employ directly employed staff or directly employed management, they cost less than if you employ them on a consultant or interim basis, and that is what we are continuing to do and that is why we will continue to reduced spending in these areas.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Clark*

Could we have a detailed breakdown of the current spend on this area for this financial year with details of the companies and the numbers employed by them and payment rates and so on?

Reply: *County Councillor Goodway*

I am sure that information can be provided, I am just staggered that the Councillor didn't ask for it in previous years.

FINANCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor Ali Ahmed*

Can you update me on the current situation of the Coal Exchange?

Reply: *County Councillor Goodway*

I can inform Council that officers are currently in discussion with the building's owner and other stakeholders and a report will be considered by the Council's Cabinet in January that will outline a way forward to secure the future of the Coal Exchange building.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Ali Ahmed*

Most of the residents, quite a few of them have asked me, they are worried about the Coal Exchange which carries a lot of history, and they are worried about the Health and Safety and their properties.

Can you assure our residents that they are safe in their properties, if we have a severe winter like we did last year; I hope we don't, if you can assure us please.

Reply: *County Councillor Goodway*

The Council will be aware that the Coal Exchange is in a serious condition and the professional advice that we have received is that it is or was in imminent danger of collapse. We have, using our powers under Section 78 of the Building Act, taken steps to ensure that the structure is safe, such that if it was to collapse then it would not be a risk to life and limb and to individuals in the area would be minimised.

What we are trying to do now through engaging with the building owner and other stakeholders like the bankers that are lending money to the building owners, we are seeing how the Council can take forward in a dialogue with Cabinet, a proposal that will secure the parts of the building we want to save and allow the redevelopment of the remainder, and of course it is the redevelopment of the remainder that will generate the money that we need which will safeguard the bits we want to keep.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Robson*

I just wanted to clarify your answer to that question, you are saying that the work that has been done is not about stopping the building collapsing, it is about should it collapse it will collapse safely. Is that what you said, could I have that clarified?

Reply: *County Councillor Russell Goodway*

That is what I said.

SPORT, LEISURE AND CULTURE QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor Bridges*

With the new bowls season starting in just a few months, users of the Maindy bowling green are concerned that they will not be able to fulfil

their fixtures because the persistent delays from Cardiff Council in considering the future ownership of the site. Will you give a public and firm guarantee that the users of the green – who have done everything which has been asked of them and acted in good faith throughout – will be supported to fulfil all of their fixtures for next year?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

As I have already mentioned the Council has met with the club on several occasions and exchanged correspondence directly relating to this matter and I have also met with the club as well.

We gave the club a commitment last year that we would keep the green in play as part of our winter maintenance regime on the basis that they would commit to the ‘buy back’ of the maintenance service.

We have carried out these works as agreed and the club has committed to this arrangement. As a result, it will be able to fulfil the fixtures next season.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Bridges*

I listened with interest to the public question and answer earlier on, and whilst I welcome the improvements to the green, improvements to the green are what green fees are there to pay for. What I want to know and what the club want to know is what Cardiff County Council will do above and beyond the norm to make sure that the pavilion is suitable for the new season and for the Community Asset Transfer process.

We heard earlier that a women’s team will be based at Maindy next season and the club are concerned that the pavilion currently is not fit for purpose as a changing space.

Can you guarantee that by April there will be a changing facility at Maindy suitable for both the men’s and women’s team?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

I would refer you back to the original answer I gave, and as Mr Castree quite clearly, made it very clear in this Chamber that he was pleased with

the work he was doing with the Council, and I think you need to take that on board because that is what the club is saying very clear.

I am going to continue to work with the club with the officers and that is the way we should be doing things.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Michael*

On the wider point of Community Asset Transfer, would you agree with me that any club that gets involved with this process needs to be vetted very clearly and they must all provide a constitution, written constitution, evidence that they have had democratic meetings, democratic elections and clear evidence of financial accountability and records, otherwise we risk of the problem of these things starting off in a flourish and coming back to the Council one way or other through the back door.

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

I certainly do agree with that but there is a big different with the St Joseph's club they have progressed this to a quite high level and I am extremely pleased with the direction we are going in and I am convinced with the way they are putting their plans forward, I am very keen that they will achieve the Community Assets Transfer, obviously I cannot give you 100% guarantee at this stage but it certainly is going in that direction.

SPORT, LEISURE & CULTURE QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor Dianne Rees*

Concerns have been raised that the Council is considering closing the Cardiff Story Museum; boxing up its contents for storage; and selling and leasing the building. Do you agree that the Cardiff Story Museum is important to the history and culture and tourism of Cardiff and can you confirm or deny that the Council is considering closing the Cardiff Story Museum?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

Currently, the Council has no choice other than to explore all avenues for how it can deal with the severe financial challenges that we face due to the cuts imposed upon us by the coalition government in London.

As you are well aware, no decision will be made on specific budget proposals until the Council meeting on 27 February 2014.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Dianne Rees*

Will you give citizens a guarantee that there will be a home for the Cardiff Story Museum in the centre of the City for the duration of this administration?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

I believe that I have already answered the question; you will have to wait until February like everybody else does, including our own group as well.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Woodman*

Would Councillor Patel please bear in mind the total disquiet from residents, particularly in Butetown, when a previous Labour administration decided to get rid of the maritime history of this city, because Cardiff Story is valuable to the citizens of Cardiff.

Point of Order: *County Councillor Goodway*

That is a scandalous allegation to make, the decision was not taken by the County Council, and why would it be, the National Museum is not part of the County Council's estate. That was made by the Conservative Government at the time and the Secretary of State Redwood. He was the one responsible for taking the museum to Swansea, not the Labour Party. I was there.

Reply: *County Councillor Ramesh Patel*

I think Councillor Goodway has answered the question.

FINANCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor Dilwar Ali*

Cardiff was made into a city in 1905 and proclaimed the capital of Wales in 1955. Can you confirm how many twinning arrangements Cardiff

Council has and how much is the cost of the twinning programme for each city?

Reply: *County Councillor Goodway*

Cardiff currently has twinning arrangements with five cities. The first formal international link was created with Stuttgart in 1955 and, over the course of the next four decades Stuttgart was joined by Lugansk, Nantes, Xiamen and Hordaland.

The total annual expenditure is currently less than £10,000 now reflecting the significant reduction in the level of activity since 1996. However, the Council values the twinning relationships that we have with our twin cities enabling us to share their cultural, environmental and economic benefits that come with those arrangements.

Next year, is the 50th anniversary of our twinning with Nantes and the Council is currently speaking with the authorities in Nantes about how we can appropriately celebrate that link next year, including working with Cardiff Business Club to invite the French Prime Minister to Cardiff at some stage during the year because when I was Leader of the Council before 2004, the current French Prime Minister was the Mayor of Nantes.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Dilwar Ali*

Is Cardiff Council planning on a twinning arrangement with the city of Sylhet in Bangladesh, or any other city worldwide?

Reply: *County Councillor Goodway*

The Council isn't currently giving consideration to establishing an additional formal twinning relationships, and I think it is unlikely to do so in the foreseeable future.

However, the Council will of course continue to receive visiting international dignitaries and delegations through the office of the Lord Mayor and the office of the Leader of the Council affording the traditional courtesies.

The Council would also, I am sure, be prepared to consider looser arrangements which would help further our cultural, educational, environmental and economic agenda, especially with Commonwealth

countries reflecting on the outcomes of the recent conference organised recently by Councillor Govier.

ENVIROMENT QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor Chris Davis*

In October of this year it was announced that Cardiff and the Vale would launch a bulk buying energy scheme known as Cyd Cymru. This scheme is chiefly designed to group a large number of people together so as to bring the price of energy down, can you reveal to the Chamber the progress that has been made so far.

Reply: *County Councillor Govier*

Thank you Councillor Davis for this question and also thank you for the support you gave me and the department when putting this scheme together.

Currently 5000 have registered; some more information is in the statement. A key measure of success for us at this moment is on pre-payment meters. I am advised that schemes of this nature usually get about a 3% pre-payment meter take up and we have doubled that at the moment. I think we have to do a bit more work on the hard to reach areas and we are looking at how we can tweak some of our messaging and some of our communications and partnerships to do that and I am also minded, depending on the success of the switches, to potentially look at other bulk buying schemes, be that insurance or broadband or whatever it may so we can help residents to achieve better prices.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Chris Davis*

This policy is the clearest example yet of what difference a Labour Council can make to the lives of ordinary people whose living standards are continually being squeezed by rising living costs.

What efforts have been made to ensure that those who are completely isolated, such as the elderly and disabled are aware and able to access this vital service?

Reply: *County Councillor Govier*

I was very conscious at the time to make sure that this was something that Cardiff Council was doing on its own. We partnered with the Vale but

also we partnered with other local authorities, and third sector organisations throughout Wales, so I was very keen to make sure that we were doing that. What we set up were packages that if any organisation came to us and wanted to be involved in Cyd Cymru we could basically give them an off the shelf type package that they could start plugging into their system. What we agreed with Cyd Cymru and the overall procurement that there would be a pay back into a community fund so there is an incentive for people to get involved in this.

We have a lot more work to do, this was a trial we have learned a lot of lessons from some of the mistakes we have made and there will be further switches down the line but we will be looking to tweak it and reach the people you identify.

FINANCE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor De'Ath*

The Co-Operative Bank are not retendering for Cardiff Council's account. What efforts have been made to ensure the authority chooses a successor that exercises probity and an ethical dimension to their business as well as sound financial management?

Reply: *County Councillor Goodway*

All bidders for the Council's banking contract must complete and comply with the requirements of a Pre-Qualification Questionnaire. The Council's documentation requires bidders to provide an assurance regarding the probity of their respective organisations. Although considered through the process, the banking services tender does not require providers to demonstrate explicitly that there is an ethical dimension to their business. I think we should note actually that when the Co-Operative Bank was awarded the Council's contract their ethical banking credentials were not a contribution when arriving at that decision.

However, reflecting on Councillor De'Ath's question and on the earlier intervention by Councillor Bale, I will investigate the possibility of injecting an ethical banking dimension into the procurement process on this occasion.

Supplementary Question : *County Councillor De'Ath*

Around 150 local authorities' bank with the Co-Op and it has been reported that many have received financial advice that they should withdraw their money from the bank in light of the recent crisis to engulf it. Up until we learned the Co-Op weren't tendering for our contract what advice was Cardiff receiving?

Reply: *County Councillor Goodway*

Similar advice and we were taking action on a daily basis so that only sufficient funds were being put into the Co-Operative Bank to fund transaction on the day and that overnight money was transferred to other accounts in order to safeguard it.

ENVIROMENT QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor Dilwar Ali*

How many abandoned shopping trolleys have the Council collect so far and how many fines have been issued to the companies which own the shopping trolleys?

Reply: *County Councillor Govier*

Over the last month when the policy was introduced Cardiff Council has collected about 200 and has fined various retail stores over £15,000.

COMMUNITIES, HOUSING AND NEIGHBOURHOOD RENEWAL QUESTION

Question 20: *County Councillor Stubbs*

Will the Cabinet Member make a statement on how UK Government cuts are affecting wards such as Splott?

Reply: *County Councillor Thorne*

As you will be aware, Cardiff, like many other Local Authorities across Wales and the UK, is facing massive cuts in funding which are being imposed by the Westminster Government. Whilst we can and are doing

all that we can to minimise the effect on our communities by making sure that we provide services in the most efficient and cost effective ways. Trying to provide a balanced budget whilst making savings of £50m will affect us all, but none more so than the poorest.

The Cabinet is currently considering the impact of the budget proposals on all our communities within Cardiff. The key focus for this administration is to ensure that, as far as possible, we protect front line services by focusing on a more joined up provision with an emphasis on more service delivery and less on buildings.

You will be aware that the administration has invested heavily in the provision of Hubs in the city, which aim to bring partner and Council services together and I would just like to confirm that a report on proposals for a Council Hub for the Splott area are due to be considered by the Cabinet in January.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor Stubbs*

Will you agree with me that on occasion during election periods residents receiving communications whose primary purpose is not necessarily clarity? This was certainly the case in Splott where certain groups were claiming that UK Government cuts would not impact Welsh budgets and ultimately the ward. Will you join with me in thanking the voters of Splott in seeing through this and recognising who the authors of these cuts are and once again putting their faith in Labour.

Reply: *County Councillor Thorne*

I can confirm whilst out was out on the doorsteps in Splott, not as often as I would have liked to have been, it was clear from peoples responses that they knew who to blame.

Supplementary Question: *County Councillor McKerlich*

Councillor Thorne, can you arrange a tutorial involving yourself and Councillor Stubbs, with Councillor Goodway because he will be able to explain to you that the Cardiff Council Block Grant does not come from Westminster, it comes from the Assembly. But can I join with both you and Councillor Stubbs in expressing sympathy with the hard pressed people from Splott who are suffering under a Labour Administration in

the Assembly setting out policies and budgets which have to be implemented by another Labour Administration at Cardiff Council.

Reply: *County Councillor Thorne*

I really can't believe the comments you have made, and you all know that the Welsh Assembly funding comes from National Government, so their funding has been reduced which then has a knock on effect.

I really just cannot believe the points that you make. I was on the doorstep in Splott and it was clear from those people I spoke to that they knew who to blame. They sometimes did not really understand the difference between a local election and a general election because what they were saying is 'we need to get that lot out' and I concurred with them.

ENVIROMENT QUESTION

Question: *County Councillor Hunt*

Does the Council have a policy on snaring on Council owned land?

Reply: *County Councillor Govier*

I am advised that the Council has no policy on snaring on Council owned land at the moment.

132 : WALES CHARTER FOR MEMBER SUPPORT AND DEVELOPMENT

Council was requested to endorse the recommendations of the Democratic Services Committee in relation to the Wales Charter for Member Support and Development and Framework Member Role Descriptions and Person Specifications.

The Chair of Democratic Services Committee, Councillor Cowan presented the report, and underlined the importance to Cardiff of achieving the Charter. The WLGA had developed the Charter for all Local Authorities; National Park Authorities and Fire Authorities. The aim of the Charter was to provide a broad framework for local planning, self assessment, action and review together with networking and

comparison amongst authorities, and the sharing of good and innovative practice. Its wide adoption would raise the overall amount and standard of support given to Members in Wales. The Committee considered that in light of the increasing challenges for Elected Members that this framework would provide all Members with the appropriate support to discharge their duties.

The Democratic Services Committee recommended that the Council works towards satisfying any requirements of the Charter that have not already achieved in the next few months and applies for the award of the Charter in the coming year, and the Chair indicated that this could be achieved without additional cost to the authority.

One of the requirements of the Charter is that Members are supported with Role Descriptions, copies of which were contained within the report.

The report was seconded by Councillor Bradbury.

The Lord Mayor invited debate on the report and the following matters were raised:

- provision of skills development as well as knowledge training;
- it was recognised that training comes at a cost however it was felt that Members should receive appropriate educational and development training without repercussions;
- individual support to Members with no political allegiances;
- visibility and promotion of Member Champions;
- importance of governance and training;
- importance of accountability to Council and the electorate;
- importance of the issues of diversity in the development of any training and development;
- that political groups also have mechanisms to support and train Members using expertise and knowledge of senior Members;
- the importance to Members of their roles in developing policy and better outcomes for Cardiff.

The Chair of Democratic Services welcomed the contributions for Members and responded accordingly. The Chair indicated that a training questionnaire will be forwarded to all Members for completion shortly so that specific training and support could be programmed tailored to Members needs.

RESOLVED – That

- (1) the information provided in Appendix A on the Wales Charter for Member Support and Development be noted;
- (2) it was agreed that the Leader signs the Statement of Intent to apply for the Charter for Member Development and Support.
- (3) authority be delegated to the County Clerk and Monitoring Officer in consultation with the Chair of Democratic Services Committee to pursue the Charter status for the Council.
- (4) the WLGA'S Framework Member Role Descriptions and Person specifications set out in Appendix B be approved

133 : APPOINTMENT OF LOCAL AUTHORITY GOVERNORS TO SCHOOL GOVERNING BODIES

(In accordance with the Members Code of Conduct Councillor Derbyshire declared a personal interest in this item)

The Council was recommended to approve the appointment of Local Authority School Governors as listed in the report.

RESOLVED - That the following appointments of School Governors be approved: -

<u>School</u>	<u>Ward</u>	<u>Start of Vacancy</u>	<u>Applications</u>
Llysfaen Primary	Lisvane	01/10/2013	Mr S L Epps
Radnor Primary	Canton	04/10/2013	Mrs R J J Meredith
Riverbank Special	Caerau	29/10/2011	Mrs J A Comrie
Greenway Primary	Rumney	22/02/2014	Mrs C Derbyshire
Llanederyn Primary	Pentwyn	23/02/2014	Ms S Eakers
St Peter's RC Primary	Plasnewydd	22/02/2014	Mrs M Samothrakis
Ysgol Glan Morfa	Splott	29/01/2014	Mr O G Jones

134 : URGENT BUSINESS

In accordance with the Council Procedure Rule 3 (xv) the Lord Mayor advised that he had not been notified

135 : COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP 2013/14

The Council received nominations to vacancies on Committees.

The nominations were proposed by Councillor Weaver and seconded by Councillor Bradbury.

RESOLVED – That the following nominations to vacancies on Committees be noted

Audit Committee	-	Councillor Weaver
Children & Young People Scrutiny Committee	-	Councillor Stubbs
Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee	-	Councillor Darren Williams

(Formal Meeting closed at 18.47pm)

In accordance with pilot Council Procedure Rule 17 (f) the following Written Questions were received for considerations and response ahead of this meeting. A full copy of all written questions together with the answers were circulated to Members by email and published on the website in advance of the Council meeting and are included as a record in the minutes of the meeting.

134 : WRITTEN QUESTIONS

COMMUNITIES, HOUSING AND NEIGHBOURHOOD RENEWAL

Question: *County Councillor McEvoy*

Who is in ownership of the anti-social behaviour (ASB) database in Cardiff? For clarity, which legal entity is registered with the Information Commissioner?

Is hearsay held on the ASB database?

Who can access the ASB database?

What is the data dictionary of the ASB database?

Reply: *County Councillor Thorne*

Who is in ownership of the anti-social behaviour (ASB) database in Cardiff? For clarity, which legal entity is registered with the Information Commissioner?

The Anti Social Behaviour Information Technology (ASBIT) database is owned equally by South Wales Police and the seven local authorities within its administrative boundaries (Bridgend; Cardiff; Merthyr Tydfil; Neath Port Talbot; Rhondda Cynon Taff Swansea and Vale of Glamorgan). South Wales Police is responsible for the day-to-day administration of the ASBIT database.

Is hearsay held on the ASB database?

No, hearsay is not held on ASBIT.

Who can access the ASB database?

The only persons who can access the database are those who have been authorised and provided with an account by the South Wales Police ASB Administrator. Authorised persons must be vetted to at least NPPV (Non Police Personnel Vetting) Level 2 by South Wales Police.

What is the data dictionary of the ASB database?

Data held on the database covers:

The record of the incident (e.g. what type of incident, when, where)
The records of people involved in the incident and their relationship to the incident
Any letters sent as a result of the incident
Any actions taken as a result of the incident
Repeat victims
Look up tables (e.g. csp, agency, gender, letter type, occupation)
Messages passed through the system by system users.

Question: *County Councillor McEvoy*

Which bodies fund the Cardiff Safety Partnership or Safer Capital Partnership or Cardiff Safer Capital Fund, by how much and to whom is the Partnership ultimately accountable?

Reply: *County Councillor Thorne*

The Cardiff Partnership is responsible for community safety in the city and brings together Cardiff Council, South Wales Police, Cardiff & Vale University Health Board, South Wales Fire & Rescue Service, Wales Probation Trust and Cardiff Third Sector Council.

The Cardiff Partnership is accountable to the individual partner organisations and also reports on performance to the Welsh Government and, in the instance of community safety, to the Police & Crime Commissioner.

The Partnership is supported through individual organisational activities and services and through grant funding from the Police & Crime Commissioner's Community Safety Fund (£148,985 per annum) and Youth Offending Service Grant (£78,662 per annum) and also the Welsh Government's Domestic Abuse Services Grant (£284,500 per annum).

EDUCATION AND LIFELONG LEARNING

Question: *County Councillor Walker*

What is your reaction to the recently published PISA results?

What implications do they have for Cardiff and how will they influence the improvement aspirations you have expressed but not yet delivered?

Reply: *County Councillor Magill*

In Wales, a total of 137 schools took part in the Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA) 2012 and pupils sat booklets in English or Welsh. The main focus for PISA 2012 was mathematics, with science and reading as minor domains. As individual schools were approached directly, we do not know the number of Cardiff schools that participated in the exercise (if any).

The PISA report notes that pupils in Wales are better able to overcome disadvantage and achieve scores higher than predicted by their background when compared with some other OECD countries. It further explains that where statistically significant differences between countries are found, these may be the result of a great number of factors.

However, the data for some of these factors were not collected in the PISA survey. Therefore, the survey results are only able to explain the reasons for differences between countries to a limited extent. For example, differences in school systems and educational experiences in different countries could play a part, but so could a wide range of different out-of-school experiences.

As a result, this means that PISA is not a test of school effectiveness. This is something that has been acknowledged by Andreas Schleicher, the senior OECD official who runs PISA, who said in an interview last year that:

“There are many different forms of students’ work – school is one, but it can be private tutoring, it can be learning reading outside school with parents and we should look at this holistically”

Nevertheless, it is clear that the PISA results for Wales are disappointing and we will continue to work with the Welsh Government, the Consortium and our schools to help secure improvements in educational attainment and standards both in Cardiff and Wales as a whole.

ENVIRONMENT

Question: *County Councillor Walker*

Will you confirm the days and frequency of road sweeping visits to Lisvane?

Will you provide me and other affected members with full details of the new regime and proposed routes to be cleaned?

Will you also consult us about such arrangements so that local knowledge and preferences can be listened to?

What proposals are in place for cleaning leaf covered footways?

Reply: *County Councillor Govier*

As was confirmed to you and other Members in my e-mail of 3 December 2013 (and which was also set out in the report entitled 'Cardiff Outdoors Project – Street Cleansing' that was considered by Cabinet on 9 December 2013), street cleansing resources have been increased significantly in Lisvane specifically as follows:

Shop fronts – daily;
Litter picking by Transit Team – Wednesdays;
Sweeping by Small Mechanical Sweeper – Mondays; and
Sweeping of main roads by a Large Mechanical Sweeper – alternate Fridays.

Close monitoring for improvement will be undertaken as for the rest of the city. As identified in the report that was considered by Cabinet on 9 December 2013, the fundamental underlying philosophy behind these initial changes is the need to move to a 'needs based service' that focuses resources efficiently upon those areas that require the most cleaning activity, rather than continuing with the historic approach which has tried, unsuccessfully, to clean every street across the city on a weekly basis to a common standard.

This 'needs based service' approach is in accordance with the Code of Practice for Litter and Refuse and Associated Guidance 2007 (Welsh Assembly Government), which recognises that the emphasis should be "*.....on the consistent and appropriate management of an area to keep it clean, not on how often it is cleaned.*" This means that cleansing resources will not be seen in all streets every week, but will be deployed where they are most required in each Ward. This will be determined by the knowledge of the front line teams, supervisory staff and also by comments and requests received from Members and other stakeholders.

You will be aware from my e-mail of 11 December 2013 that consultation on the draft Community Litter Plan is ongoing. Members and other stakeholders have the opportunity to feedback comments regarding the draft plan or related matters through this process. In addition, Members are, of course, welcome to provide feedback regarding the new arrangements via the Member Enquiry Line. Alternatively, Members who

wish to log a request for service via the Intranet can use the Member Enquiry Capture Form and will be able to track the progress of their request on the system.

As I advised at Council in November, this new approach is not a trial, but a positive step towards improving the way in which the Council manages adopted highway areas across the city. Clearly, with any such changes, in the light of operational experience and stakeholder feedback, some subsequent adjustments may need to be made to the deployment of resources.

Finally, regarding leaves, pedestrians and other road users do need to take appropriate care where leaf fall is on the ground as the Council is unable to collect all leaf fall from all adopted highway areas across the city.

Leaves will be cleared as much as possible by the teams during their normal cleansing rounds. However, as the removal of litter and waste from Cardiff's streets is prioritised, the teams will focus on this before attending to the sweeping of leaves, where capacity allows. Consideration is being given to change this focus for the period of November and December each year. This will, of course, be dependent upon each area's requirements and supervisors will be monitoring those streets known to be heavily affected by leaf fall and will determine operational priorities based on their observations. However, currently as in previous years, teams will be diverted from their normal cleansing rounds for parts of their working day in order to undertake some dedicated leaf fall collection work in the identified priority areas.

Question: *County Councillor Walker*

It is understood that you have looked at studies comparing efficiency, manning and costs of waste collection provision in comparable cities and compared them with Cardiff's performance. Will you set out this comparison, including the collection data on all types of waste, in your response (or circulate it by email) so that councillors can share the insights provided by this data?

Reply: *County Councillor Govier*

As was stated in the report entitled 'Cardiff Outdoors – Efficiencies, Cost Savings, and Operational Improvements', which was considered by

Cabinet in July 2013, the significant and unprecedented financial pressures now faced by the Council mean that performance and efficiency are critical to service delivery.

In respect of the collection of waste and street cleansing, best practice performance measures and efficiency models against other comparable councils are currently being collated and analysed. Some of the results are quite startling and, once finalised, I will arrange for a summary to be provided to Members through an appropriate future Cabinet report.

I understand that colleagues on the Environmental Scrutiny Committee are also reviewing other councils' delivery models. When that task and finish group report is presented to Cabinet in the future, we will respond accordingly.

SPORT, LEISURE AND CULTURE

Question: *County Councillor Walker*

Staff at Leisure Centres have been briefed to expect radical changes to the structure and funding of leisure provision. Will you now also brief councillors so that we can understand your thinking on the future of these centres and set out the timetable for announcements on this important matter?

Reply: *County Councillor Patel*

You will be well aware of the current financial challenges facing local government and also of the Council's own budget setting process. No decisions will be made on specific budget proposals until the Council meeting on 27 February 2014. Budget proposals will also be subject to consultation and consideration by the Council's Scrutiny Committees in advance of that meeting.

STRATEGIC PLANNING AND TRANSPORT

Question: *County Councillor Bradbury*

Could the Cabinet Member look into designating the area around Mary Immaculate/Caerau Lane down the hill to Heol Trelai a 20mph zone for the safety of the pupils of Mary Immaculate and those residents who live there?

Reply: *County Councillor Hinchey*

I am advised that Mary Immaculate High School has a school safety zone. You will also be aware that traffic calming measures (speed cushions) are currently in place along Caerau Lane from the school down the hill to Heol Trelai.

I can confirm that an investigation by officers into speed concerns on Caerau Lane is currently ongoing and I would be happy to discuss the findings of this exercise and any specific concerns with both you and Councillor Simmons in due course.

Question: *County Councillor Walker*

The authority seems to be moving away from road narrowing as a means of traffic calming in favour of speed reducing platforms. Existing single vehicle passage road narrowing schemes continue to cause traffic tail back. What are your plans to replace such schemes with alternatives which allow traffic flow whilst reducing speed?

Reply: *County Councillor Hinchey*

We have plans to continue the programme of replacing priority narrowings with two-way tabled narrowings. These will maintain reduced speeds, while still allowing the smooth two-way flow of traffic. However, these plans are subject to funding provision and, to date, we have only been able to replace narrowings at approximately four locations within the city over a two year period. I can confirm that we are prioritising those locations which are on distributor roads and which are also busy bus routes.